1 2 3 4 5	MELISSA W. KASNITZ (SBN162679) KEVIN KNESTRICK (SBN 229620) DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES 2001 Center Street, Third Floor Berkeley, California 94704 Telephone: (510) 665-8644 Facsimile: (510) 665-8511 TTY: (510) 665-8716 Email: general@dralegal.org					
6	Attorneys for Plaintiffs					
7						
8						
9	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT					
10	EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA					
11						
12						
13	GARY NYSTROM on behalf of himself, and	Case No. CIV S-040330 MCE-PAN				
14	on behalf of all others similarly situated,					
15	Plaintiffs,	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT				
16	v.					
17	CITY OF VACAVILLE and DALE PFEIFFER, Director of the Department of					
18	Public Works of the City of Vacaville, or his					
19	successor, in his Official Capacity,					
20	Defendants.					
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						
26						
27						
28						

# DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES 449 Fifteenth Street, Suite 303 Oakland, California 94612 (510) 451-8644

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

2	I.	RECITALS1		
3	II.	DEFINITIONS		
4		A.	ADA/ADAAG	2
5		B.	Class or Class Members	3
6		C.	Class Counsel	3
7		D.	Compliance Period	3
8		E.	Compliant Curb Ramp	3
9		F.	Curb Ramp	4
10		G.	Defendants	4
11		H.	Detectable Warnings	4
12		I.	Fairness Hearing	4
13		J.	Final Approval	4
14		K.	Fundamental Alteration.	4
15		L.	Mobility Disability	5
16		M.	Named Plaintiff	5
17		N.	Objection	5
18		O.	Parties	5
19		P.	Pedestrian Rights of Way	5
20		Q.	Preliminary Approval	5
21		R.	Released Claims/Released Parties	6
22		S.	Settlement Agreement	6
23		T.	Statutory Defenses	6
24		U.	Structurally Impracticable	6
25		V.	Technically Infeasible	6
26		W.	Third Party Entity	6
27		X.	Title 24	7
28		Y.	Undue Burden	7
	I			

Nystrom vs. City of Vacaville, Case No.: CIV S-040330 MCE-PAN SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

# DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES 449 Fifteenth Street, Suite 303 Oakland, California 94612 (510) 451-8644

III.	APPR	ROVAL7			
	A.	Joint Approval Action		al Action	7
	B.	Notice to the Class		Class	7
	C.	. Objections			8
	D.	No Opt-Out Right for Class Members			8
	E. Fairness Hearing		ing	8	
IV. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF  A. ADA Advisory Committee			EF	8	
			ry Committee	8	
	B.	Advis	ory Coi	mmittee Fund	9
	C.	Advis	ory Coi	mmittee: Responsibilities Re: Pedestrian Rights of Way	9
		1.	Select	ion and Prioritization of Barrier Removal Projects	9
			a.	Barriers to be Addressed	10
			b.	General Prioritization Standards	10
			c.	Annual Selection Process	11
			d.	Limitations on Barrier Removal	11
			e.	Barriers Under Control of Third Party Entities	11
			f.	Work Completed Before Agreement is Finalized	12
		2.	Levera	aging Additional Funding Sources and City Programs	13
		3.	Comn	nunity Outreach Program	13
D. Additional Funding		ınding	13		
	E. Street Overlays and Reconstruction			ys and Reconstruction	13
	F.	F. Dedicated Funding  G. City Monitoring of New Permitted Development and Alterations			13
	G.				14
	<ul> <li>H. City Monitoring of Permitted Work to Existing Driveways</li> <li>I. Sidewalk Maintenance Program</li> </ul>			ing of Permitted Work to Existing Driveways	14
				intenance Program	14
J. Preventative Efforts to Deter Movable Barriers			Efforts to Deter Movable Barriers	15	
	K. Slurry Seal Requirement		equirement	15	
	L.	L. Annual Exhaustion of Advisory Committee Fund		15	

# DISABILITY RIGHTS ADVOCATES 449 Fifteenth Street, Suite 303 Oakland, California 94612 (510) 451-8644

V.	V. REPORTS AND MONITORING		16		
	A.	Reports	16		
	B.	Monitoring Process	17		
	C.	Extension of Monitoring Period	18		
	D.	Monitoring Fees	18		
VI.	DISP	UTE RESOLUTION	19		
	A.	Jurisdiction	19		
	B.	Scope of Dispute Resolution Process	19		
	C.	Dispute Resolution Procedure	19		
	D.	Fees and Costs for Dispute Resolution	20		
VII.	DAM	IAGES, ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS	20		
	A.	Damages	20		
	B.	Attorneys' Fees and Costs	20		
VIII.	RELI	EASES	21		
	A.	Named Plaintiff and Class Release of Injunctive Relief Claims	21		
	B.	Named Plaintiff's Release of Damages Claims	22		
	C.	No Release of Named Plaintiff's Future Tort Damages	22		
	D.	No Release of Class Tort Damages	23		
IX.	MISCELLANEOUS				
	A.	Point Person	23		
	B.	Dismissal	23		
	C.	Entire Agreement	23		
	D.	Counterparts	23		
	E.	Interpretation	24		
	F.	Severability	24		

#### ١. RECITALS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- Plaintiff Gary Nystrom is a person with a disability within the meaning of 1. applicable state and federal law who regularly uses the Pedestrian Rights of Way in the City of Vacaville.
- 2. Mr. Nystrom brought this action, known as Nystrom v. City of Vacaville, et. al., Case No. S-04-330 MCE PAN, in the United States District Court for the Eastern District of California on February 17, 2004 alleging that Defendant City of Vacaville and Defendant Dale Pfieffer, acting in his official capacity as the Director of the Department of Public Works for the City of Vacaville (collectively "City"), violated Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act, 42 U.S.C. et seq. ("ADA"), Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, 29 U.S.C. § 1254(1), ("Section 504"), and various California statutes requiring access for persons with disabilities by failing to install curb cuts and otherwise provide access to streets and sidewalks under jurisdiction of the City. The City denies all allegations. The Parties recognize that the City has been installing curb ramps in all new development since 1974 and that the City has installed curb ramps in response to citizen complaints for approximately ten years.
- 3. The Parties now desire to resolve their differences and disputes by settling the suit in such a manner as to:
- Provide Program Access to Pedestrian Rights of Way in Vacaville for a. qualified individuals with disabilities, pursuant to existing federal and state law;
- h. Provide access as set forth below to all portions of the Pedestrian Rights of Way that constitute new construction or alteration;
- Assure that neither the Named Plaintiff nor the Class nor any Class c. Member will attempt to enforce, and Defendants will not thereby be subject to, conflicting standards regarding compliance with Title II of the ADA, Section 504, and California access laws concerning access to Pedestrian Rights of Way for persons with Mobility and/or Vision Disabilities:

28

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

d. Assure that neither the Named Plaintiff nor the Class, nor any Class Member shall hereafter assert or claim that Defendants are required to make additional and/or different modifications to its Pedestrian Rights of Way or that they are required to follow different standards beyond what is agreed to herein in order to comply with the existing provisions of Title II of the ADA, Section 504, or California access laws concerning: (1) Providing Program Access to qualified individuals with disabilities along existing Pedestrian Rights of Way and (2) Providing access in areas of new construction and/or alteration;

Avoid the uncertainties and costs of further litigation in this matter for all e. Parties.

#### 11. **DEFINITIONS**

As used in this Agreement, the following terms shall have the meaning ascribed to them in this Section, which are consistent with the provisions of existing federal and state law, including the regulations promulgated thereunder. Except to the extent expressly stated to the contrary, any term not expressly defined in this Section or elsewhere in this Agreement that has an expressly defined meaning in either the ADA or the regulations promulgated thereunder ("Regulations") shall have the meaning ascribed to it by the ADA or the Regulations, in that order of preference. All other terms shall be interpreted according to their plain and ordinary meaning.

#### Α. ADA/ADAAG

"ADA" means and refers to the Americans with Disabilities Act as contained at 42 U.S.C. § 12101 et seq. "ADAAG" means and refers to the Americans with Disabilities Act Access Guidelines, codified at Appendix A to 28 Code of Federal Regulations part 36 and at Appendix A to 49 Code of Federal Regulations part 37. "ADAAG Standards" means and refers to physical conditions that meet the new construction and/or alterations standards set forth in ADAAG.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

#### Β. Class or Class Members

"Class" or "Class Members" means and refers to the class as defined in the Parties' Joint Motion for Court Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement. The class is defined as: all persons with Mobility and/or Vision Disabilities who seek full and equal access pertaining to curb cuts and sidewalks in the City of Vacaville's Pedestrian Rights of Way. This includes visitors as well as residents of the City of Vacaville.

#### C. Class Counsel

"Class Counsel" means and refers to the law firm of Disability Rights Advocates.

#### D. Compliance Period

"Compliance Period" means and refers to the period of time for which this Agreement will be in effect. The Parties agree that the Agreement shall become effective upon Final Approval, and remain in effect for up to 30 years. The City may petition the Court to dissolve the Agreement at any time upon a showing that it provides Program Access to Pedestrian Rights of Way or upon a showing that it has met or exceeded the monetary obligations specified in this Agreement. Alternatively, the Agreement will remain in effect until it dissolves automatically 30 years after Final Approval.

# Ε. Compliant Curb Ramp

"Compliant Curb Ramp" means and refers to a curb ramp that is constructed to comply with state and/or federal law (whichever provides the higher access standard) in place at the time of construction. In the case of a location where it is Structurally Impracticable or Technically Infeasible to build a fully compliant curb ramp, or where construction of a fully compliant curb ramp would constitute a Fundamental Alteration of a service, program, or activity of the City of Vacaville or an Undue Burden on the City of Vacaville, a curb ramp that complies with access standards to the maximum extent feasible will constitute a Compliant Curb Ramp as long as the requirements set forth in this Agreement for justifying the reasons for the City to avoid full compliance are met.

#### F. Curb Ramp

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

"Curb Ramp" is used interchangeably with "curb cut."

#### G. Defendants

"Defendants" means and refers to the City of Vacaville and Dale Pfieffer or his successor, acting in his or her official capacity as the Director of the Department of Public Works for the City of Vacaville.

# Η. Detectable Warnings

"Detectable Warnings" means and refers to truncated domes which provide a tactile surface at the transition between the curb and the street, assisting pedestrians with Vision Disabilities in determining when they enter the street.

## ١. Fairness Hearing

"Fairness Hearing" means and refers to the hearing described in § III.E., below.

#### J. Final Approval

"Final Approval" means and refers to the date when the Court issues an order granting final approval of this Settlement Agreement in Case No. S-04-330 MCE PAN.

#### Κ. Fundamental Alteration

"Fundamental Alteration" means and refers to an action that, if taken by the City of Vacaville, would result in fundamental alteration in the nature of the service, program or activity of Pedestrian Rights of Way in the City of Vacaville. If the City claims that any action otherwise required by this Agreement would constitute a Fundamental Alteration, the City shall have to demonstrate that such alteration would result, and the decision that an action would constitute a Fundamental Alteration must be made by the Director of the Department of Public Works or his or her designee after considering all funds available for such work, and must be accompanied by a written statement of the reasons for reaching that conclusion.

/ / /

# Oakland, California 94612

(510) 451-8644

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

g

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

#### L. M obility Disability

"Mobility Disability" means and refers, with respect to an individual, to any physical or mental impairment or condition that substantially limits an individual's ability to move his or her body or a portion of his or her body and includes, but is not limited to, orthopedic and neuromotor disabilities and any other impairment or condition that limits an individual's ability to walk, maneuver around objects, ascend or descend steps or slopes, and operate controls. An individual with a Mobility Disability may use a wheelchair or motorized scooter for mobility, or may be Semi-Ambulatory.

## Μ. Named Plaintiff

"Named Plaintiff" means and refers to Gary Nystrom

#### N. Objection

"Objection" means and refers to any written objection submitted by any Class Member as described in § III.C., below.

#### Ο. **Parties**

"Parties" means and refers to the City of Vacaville, Dale Pfieffer, or his successor, acting in his or her official capacity as the Director of the Department of Public Works for the City of Vacaville, Gary Nystrom, and all class members.

#### P. Pedestrian Rights of Way

"Pedestrian Rights of Way" means and refers to all sidewalks over which the City of Vacaville has responsibility or authority as well as all Curb Ramps and crosswalks serving such sidewalks and any other pathways used by pedestrians along public rights of way, including pedestrian pathways through public parking lots.

# Ο. Preliminary Approval

"Preliminary Approval" means and refers to the preliminary approval by the Court in Case No. S-04-330 MCE PAN of the terms of this Settlement Agreement which shall occur prior to any notice being provided in accordance with § III.C., below.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

#### R. R eleased Claims/R eleased Parties

"Released Claims" and "Released Parties" mean and refer to those claims and Parties described in § VIII, below.

# S. Settlement Agreement

"Settlement Agreement" or "Agreement" means and refers to this document.

## Τ. **Statutory Defenses**

"Statutory Defenses" means and refers to the City's right to assert under this Agreement that removal of any barrier or installation of a Compliant Curb Ramp is not required because such barrier removal or curb ramp installation would be Technically Infeasible, or Structurally Impracticable, or that it would constitute an Undue Burden or Fundamental Alteration.

# U. Structurally Impracticable

Structurally Impracticable means and refers to circumstances in which the unique characteristics of terrain prevent the incorporation of accessibility features. If it is structurally impracticable to provide full access at any location along pedestrian rights of way, the City shall comply with access requirements to the extent that it is not structurally impracticable to do so. (See ADAAG § 4.1.1(5)(a)).

# ٧. Technically Infeasible

"Technically Infeasible" means, with respect to an alteration of a building, facility or Pedestrian Right of Way that it has little likelihood of being accomplished because existing physical or site constraints prohibit modification or addition of elements, spaces, or features which are in full and strict compliance with the minimum requirements for new construction and which are necessary to provide accessibility (See ADAAG § 4.1.6(1)(j)).

# W. Third Party Entity

"Third-Party Entity" means an entity other than the City of Vacaville that controls certain barriers or elements of barriers in a Pedestrian Rights of Way. Transit agencies and local utilities are examples of Third Party Entities.

#### Χ. Title 24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

"Title 24" means and refers to the regulations set forth at Title 24 of the California Code of Regulations.

#### Υ. Undue Burden

"Undue Burden" means and refers to an action that, if taken by the City of Vacaville, would result in an undue financial and administrative burden. In order to demonstrate that removal of a barrier would constitute an Undue Burden, the decision must be made by the Director of the Department of Public Works or his or her designee after considering all resources available from the Advisory Committee Fund, as defined at § IV.B., below, and any other source of funding identified in this Agreement available for removal of sidewalk barriers, and must be accompanied by a written statement of the reasons for reaching that conclusion. In preparing such a statement, the Director or designee may consider the usability of the existing facilities.

#### III. APPROVAL

## Α. Joint Approval Action

Within 60 days following the Vacaville City Council's approval of this Agreement, the Parties shall jointly move the Court for an Order certifying a Settlement Class, granting Preliminary Approval to this Agreement, and setting a hearing for Final Approval, allowing for notice as set by the Court.

#### Β. Notice to the Class

The City shall issue a Settlement Notice in the form attached hereto as Exhibit A, advising the Class of the terms of the proposed Settlement Agreement and their right to object to the proposed Settlement Agreement, within 30 days after Preliminary Approval. This notice shall be published in the legal notices section of the Vacaville Reporter and posted on the internet web site of the City of Vacaville. In addition, Class Counsel may post the notice in its internet website and post the notice in internet forums targeted at people with disabilities.

Oakland, California 94612

#### C. Objections

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Any Class Member may object to the proposed Settlement Agreement by filing with the Clerk of the Court a written objection ("Objection") filed or postmarked no later than a date to be set by the Court in this case after Preliminary Approval of the Settlement Agreement. Only such objecting Class Members shall have the right, if they seek it in their Objection, to present objections orally at the Fairness Hearing.

# D. No Opt-Out Right for Class Members

Because this settlement resolves only class claims for declaratory and injunctive relief, as well as claims for damages by the named plaintiff, and it does not provide for damages for any individual Class Member, nor does it release any claims an individual Class Member may have for damages, no Class Member may opt out of the terms of this Settlement Agreement.

#### Ε. Fairness Hearing

The Court shall hold a hearing to establish the fairness of the Settlement Agreement and to decide whether there shall be Final Approval of the Settlement Agreement. This hearing will take place at a date to be set by the Court, allowing for a period of notice to the Class as the Court may direct.

#### IV. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

# Α. ADA Advisory Committee

The City of Vacaville has established an ADA Advisory Committee ("Advisory Committee") comprised of representatives from City government and Vacaville residents. The Committee presently meets at least once a month to discuss issues related to disability and access. If the ADA Advisory Committee is disbanded or becomes inactive at any time during the life of this Agreement, the responsibilities of the ADA Advisory Committee under this Agreement, as set forth below, will be assigned to its successor, if any, or to the Director of the Department of Public Works.

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

(510) 451-8644

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# B. <u>Advisory Committee Fund</u>

The City will dedicate the equivalent of 5% of its annual gas tax revenue (Sections 2105 and 2106) or a minimum of \$50,000 (whichever is greater), to a fund used exclusively to install Complaint Curb Ramps or remove barriers in the Pedestrian Rights of Way (including sidewalks and pedestrian pathways in public parking lots). This fund will be known as the "Advisory Committee Fund." All work described in this Agreement shall be paid for through this fund with the exception of work done in conjunction with street overlays and reconstruction (*see* § IV.E., below), work done using dedicated funding (*see* § IV.F., below), and work affecting barriers under the control of third party entities (*see* § IV.C.1.e., below). Projects using the money from this fund will be selected by the City's ADA Advisory Committee with reference to the general guidelines set forth in this Agreement and with approval of the Director of the Department of Public Works. The selection of projects is only subject to challenge under the Dispute Resolution Process set forth in § VI., below, if Class Counsel has a good faith belief that the Advisory Committee and the Director of the Department of Public Works have abused their discretion to select projects in accordance with these guidelines.

# C. Advisory Committee: Responsibilities Re: Pedestrian Rights of Way

The ADA Advisory Committee is charged with specific responsibilities under this Agreement related to barrier removal and access along the City's Pedestrian Rights of Way. For the life of this Agreement, the ADA Advisory Committee or its successor pursuant to § IV.A., above, shall have ongoing responsibility for the following:

# 1. <u>Selection and Prioritization of Barrier Removal Projects</u>

The Advisory Committee shall make recommendations regarding barrier removal projects to be prioritized and funded from the Advisory Committee Fund annually. The recommendations of the Advisory Committee shall be submitted to the Director of the Department of Public Works for review and approval. The Director of the Department of Public Works shall have final authority over the approval and authorization of projects; however the Director will not unreasonably disregard the recommendations of the Advisory Committee.

(510) 451-8644

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

# a. Barriers to be Addressed

The Advisory Committee Fund may be used for the following projects: (1) Installing Compliant Curb Ramps, including Detectable Warnings (at intersections where there are no curb ramps or where existing curb ramps do not meet current access standards); (2) Providing accessible crosswalks (by providing appropriate contrasting striping, developing or maintaining a policy concerning audible pedestrian signals, providing accessible pedestrian crossing controls, and removing any abrupt changes in level affecting the path of travel across the street; crosswalk access does not require any effort to remove slopes or cross slopes consistent with the slope of the street for vehicle traffic and/or drainage); (3) Removing obstacles in the Pedestrian Rights of Way that narrow the pedestrian pathway to less than 32 inches; (4) Removing abrupt changes of level, whether caused by tree roots or any other deterioration or displacement of the surface of the Pedestrian Rights of Way; (5) Removing or providing Detectable Warnings for overhanging obstacles below 80 inches above the pedestrian rights of way that are not detectible to a blind pedestrian using a cane; and (6) removing excessive cross slopes perpendicular to the primary direction of travel along the pedestrian rights of way, whether caused by driveways crossing the Pedestrian Right of Way or by any other reason. This obligation does not require the City to initiate eminent domain proceedings against any residential property owner in order to address any barrier; see § IV.C.1.d.(2), below. If any eminent domain proceedings are initiated against any commercial property owner in order to address any barrier, the City's costs for such action shall come from the Advisory Committee Fund.

# b. General Prioritization Standards

The following general principles shall be used by the ADA Advisory Committee and the Director of the Department of Public Works to prioritize projects to be funded through the Advisory Committee Fund. Requests for installation of a Compliant Curb Ramp or removal of a specific barrier or barriers from a Class Member shall have the highest priority. After requests, priority will be given to Pedestrian Rights of Way serving (1) state and local government offices and facilities; (2) important transportation corridors; (3) places of public accommodation such as commercial and business zones; (4) facilities containing employers; and (5) other areas such as

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

residential neighborhoods and undeveloped regions of the City. In all planned projects, consideration will also be given to the severity of existing barriers and overall efficiency of project work. The Advisory Committee and the Director of the Department of Public Works have discretion to authorize the removal of barriers in lower priority categories before removing barriers in higher priority categories if they deem such prioritization to be a more effective or efficient use of barrier removal resources.

#### c. Annual Selection Process

Every year, the Advisory Committee shall select and prioritize a list of barrier removal projects no later than 60 days after the beginning of the new fiscal year. This list will be provided to the Director of the Department of Public Works, who will approve a final list no later than 90 days after the beginning of the new fiscal year. The list of barriers approved by the Director of the Department of Public Works will be included in the yearly "Access Report" (see § V.A.). The list of barrier removal projects may be revised by the Director of the Department of Public Works, in consultation with the ADA Advisory Committee, during the course of the fiscal year.

#### d. Limitations on Barrier Removal

- (1) Under no circumstances will the City be obligated to remove any barrier if removal of such barrier would create an Undue Burden or a Fundamental Alteration, or if removal of such barrier would be Technically Infeasible or Structurally Impracticable. To the extent that the City determines that it would be an Undue Burden or Fundamental Alteration to remove a particular barrier, or that removal of a particular barrier would be Technically Infeasible or Structurally Impracticable, it must include such a determination in its regular reports as set forth in § V.A., below.
- (2) Under no circumstances will the City be obligated to initiate eminent domain proceedings against a residential property owner in order to address any barrier.

#### Barriers Under Control of Third Party Entities e.

Certain barriers in the Pedestrian Right of Way involve elements under the control of entities other than the City of Vacaville. The Parties acknowledge that the City has no right or Oakland, California 94612 (510) 451-8644 1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

obligation to remove such barriers unilaterally. The Parties agree to work cooperatively to seek funding or participation in barrier removal work from such third party entities, which may include transit agencies, local utilities, or other entities that maintain equipment in the Pedestrian Rights of Way. Any contribution of money for barrier removal work by third party entities or any work done by such third party entities to remove barriers will be in addition to the work done based on the other obligations set forth in this Agreement. Money from the Advisory Committee Fund may be appropriated to supplement work performed under this section at the discretion of the Advisory Committee and the Director of Public Works, as set forth § IV.C.1.c., above.

## f. Work Completed Before Agreement is Finalized

During the 2005/2006 Fiscal Year, the City conducted barrier removal work in accordance with the general principles set forth in this Agreement, despite the fact that the Agreement was not finalized. The City allocated approximately \$50,000 for work to remove barriers, in addition to the construction of Compliant Curb Ramps at all intersections where street overlays were completed. In addition, the City allocated approximately \$20,000 for the removal of certain barriers identified by the Named Plaintiff in this action, including installation of Compliant Curb Ramps at the intersection of Tulare and Marshall (at two corners), Marshall and Windward Court (at two corners), and Tulare and Klamath (at two corners) and remediation of the asphalt lip at the two corners of Raleigh Drive and Alamo Drive.

In light of this work that was done before the Agreement was finalized, the Parties agree that the City may meet its obligation under the Agreement for Fiscal Years 06/07 and 07/08 by dedicating the equivalent of 4% of its annual gas tax revenue (Sections 2105 and 2106) or a minimum of \$40,000 (whichever is greater), to the Advisory Committee Fund.

The Parties also agree that, at minimum, \$20,000 of the money in the Advisory Committee Fund during FY 06/07 will be used to address the remaining barriers identified by the Named Plaintiff in the Complaint. All barriers identified by the Named Plaintiff in the Complaint that are not addressed through the Advisory Committee Fund during FY 06/07 will be treated as class member complaints and addressed through the prioritization process set forth in § IV.C.1.b, above.

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

(510) 451-8644

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 2. Leveraging Additional Funding Sources and City Programs

The Advisory Committee shall confer with the City's Title II Coordinator a minimum of one time per year to assess how to best leverage additional City funds, if any, and/or additional City Programs, if any, that can be used to install Compliant Curb Cuts or remove barriers along the City's Pedestrian Rights of Way.

# 3. <u>Community Outreach Program</u>

The Advisory Committee shall develop and oversee the City's Community Outreach Program. The Community Outreach Program shall be designed to seek input from the public regarding the City's ongoing barrier removal efforts. As part of its Community Outreach Program, the ADA Advisory Committee will hold annual community meetings for the first three years of the Compliance Period to discuss the City's Transition Plan and to help further identify new and existing physical barriers to access along the City's Pedestrian Rights of Way. After the first three years of the Compliance Period, the ADA Advisory Committee may hold additional community meetings at its discretion, but in no instance shall it go more than five years without holding such a community meeting.

# D. Additional Funding

If any new transportation funding source for street maintenance is created during the life of this Agreement (through a ballot measure or otherwise), 5% of this additional revenue source or the equivalent will also be dedicated to the Advisory Committee Fund.

# E. <u>Street Overlays and R econstruction</u>

Each time the City overlays or reconstructs a street, it will ensure that Compliant Curb Ramps are installed at each intersection as part of the overlay project. This requirement does not pertain to slurry seals, cape seals, or base failure repairs. This work will be in addition to the work supported by the Advisory Committee Fund.

# F. <u>Dedicated Funding</u>

If the City obtains dedicated funding for any additional street overlays or reconstruction, it will ensure that Compliant Curb Ramps are installed at each intersection as part of the overlay or reconstruction project. If the City obtains dedicated funding for redevelopment work that

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

includes complete removal and reconstruction of a section of Pedestrian Right of Way, the City will ensure that the reconstructed sidewalk is accessible, subject to all available defenses. This work will be in addition to the work supported by the Advisory Committee Fund.

#### G. City Monitoring of New Permitted Development and Alterations

The City will monitor all permitted construction work approved after the Effective Date of this Agreement affecting the Pedestrian Rights of Way to ensure that it conforms to the requirements set forth in this Agreement. In any location where an access feature required under the terms of this Agreement does not fully conform to access standards, and where the City claims that full compliance is not required due to any Statutory Defense, the City's explanation of its determination that full access is not required will be included and explained in the next Annual Report.

## Η. City Monitoring of Permitted Work to Existing Driveways

The City will monitor all permitted work for existing driveways. The City will not approve any permit to modify an existing driveway that would create an unreasonable crossslope or worsen an existing cross-slope within the path of travel along Pedestrian Rights of Way.

# ١. Sidewalk Maintenance Program

Under Vacaville Municipal Code Chapter 12.30, property owners are currently required to maintain their sidewalks in such a way that they do not impede public access, pose a safety hazard, endanger persons or property, or interfere with public convenience. The City maintains a Sidewalk Maintenance Program which provides private property owners a sidewalk and driveway inspection in the front of their property, free of charge, by a City employee. If repairs are required, the property owner can either do the work, hire a licensed contractor or request that the City do the repairs and then bill the private property owner. When private property owners fail to fix problem sidewalks after being notified by the City, the City may make required repairs and place a lien on the property owner's lot or lots to recoup costs, if necessary. The Parties anticipate that the City's ongoing use of this program will result in the removal of certain abrupt

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

changes in level on sidewalks. The City commits to maintain this program at the current level of services during the life of this Agreement to the extent that it remains lawful to do so.

## J. Preventative Efforts to Deter M ovable Barriers

Subject to its discretionary authority under the provisions of California Government Code § 818.2, the City will take reasonable steps to prevent or deter the placement of movable barriers on sidewalks, which may, but need not include conducting public information campaigns through mailers, providing community information, and utilizing other avenues of communication recommended by the Advisory Committee. The Advisory Committee may consult with the City's Code Compliance officers to increase public awareness of issues related to access along the City's Pedestrian Rights of Way. The Advisory Committee may, at its discretion, recommend use of Advisory Committee Funds to promote increased awareness of disability access issues within the community.

# Κ. Slurry Seal Requirement

The City will include in any slurry sealing work or cape sealing work it performs a requirement to look for excessive build up which can create an inaccessible "lip" in the curb ramp area and grind down any such lips subject to the City's claim that such work is subject to any Statutory Defenses.

# Annual Exhaustion of Advisory Committee Fund

The City contemplates that the entire amount of the Advisory Committee Fund will be expended annually. Any funds not used in any given fiscal year(s) will be carried over into the succeeding year(s). Any expenditure(s) that exceed the amount of money in the Fund in a given fiscal year(s) will be credited in the succeeding fiscal year(s). In the event that the City allocates funds in excess of the annual obligation to the Advisory Committee Fund in any given year, such excess funds will be credited toward its future obligations in each succeeding fiscal year. However, in no year shall the City allocate less than \$25,000 to the Advisory Committee Fund. If the Agreement is terminated early based on a petition by the City that it has otherwise met its financial obligations (see § I.D., above), this annual minimum allocation requirement shall also cease.

# 449 Fifteenth Street, Suite 303 Oakland, California 94612

#### ٧. REPORTS AND MONITORING

#### Α. R eports

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

At the conclusion of each fiscal year until the end of the Compliance Period, the City shall provide a report ("Annual Report") to Class Counsel describing the actual work done to implement this Agreement during the previous twelve months and a prospective plan of projects the City plans on undertaking to improve access to Pedestrian Rights of Way in the upcoming year. The Annual Report will be completed within one hundred and twenty (120) days from the end of the fiscal year and will include:

- 1. A summary or listing of all written complaints or requests for removal of particular barriers received since the prior report, including information specifying whether the City has taken action to remove the barrier.
- 2. Summaries of work done to ensure access and/or remove access barriers in conjunction with asphalt overlay projects, projects completed with Dedicated Funds (as described in § IV.F, above), and projects completed with the Advisory Committee Fund.
- 3. A list of all barriers, if any, for which the City asserts that it has a Statutory Defense excusing installation of a Compliant Curb Ramp or removal of an access barrier. If the City asserts that it has a Statutory Defense that limits its ability to remove a barrier or to install a Curb Ramp that meets all current standards, the City will include in the report a written statement by the Director of the Department of Public Works (or his or her designee) providing the reasons for reaching that conclusion. To the extent that the City claims that installation of a fully compliant Curb Ramp or removal of an existing barrier would be an Undue Burden, the written statement will include his or her consideration of all resources available from the Advisory Committee Fund and any other source of funding set forth in this Agreement as available for the removal of access barriers.
- 4. Information regarding removal of barriers along Pedestrian Rights of Way through the Sidewalk Maintenance Program of the City's Public Works Department.

27 / / /

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 5. Information describing efforts made by the City or Advisory Committee to leverage additional programs or funding sources to install Compliant Curb Ramps or remove access barriers in the Pedestrian Rights of Way.
- 6. Information regarding efforts at Community Outreach, and any action being taken as a result of such community outreach.
- 7. Information documenting all barrier removal efforts accomplished in conjunction with Third Parties (such as utility companies).
- 8. A prospective plan of projects for the upcoming year based on the priority recommendations of the City's ADA Advisory Committee; and approved by the Director of Public Works or his/her designee.
- 9. A Monitoring Report, as described below, for the first three years of the Compliance Period.

#### Β. Monitoring Process

The City of Vacaville will utilize a Registered Professional Civil Engineer who is either employed by the Public Works Department or designated by the Director of Public Works ("The Engineer") to monitor the City's compliance with this Agreement for a period of three years from the date of execution. The Engineer will annually inspect 8-10% of the locations within the Pedestrian Rights of Way at which barriers have been removed to ensure that such barrier removal is completed properly within acceptable tolerances. Such inspections will determine whether there are remaining barriers at sites that were identified as having all barriers removed, or whether barrier removal work was completed properly. The Engineer will annually produce a report ("Monitoring Report") containing his or her findings to the City and to Class Counsel. The Monitoring Report may be prepared in conjunction with or as part of the Annual Report at the discretion of the Director of Public Works.

Following the production of each Monitoring Report, the City will have 60 days to remedy or develop a plan to remedy any identified remaining barriers or else determine that there is a dispute regarding such barriers at any specific location. If the City asserts that there is a dispute regarding any barrier, it may assert any Statutory Defense as part of the Dispute

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Resolution Process. If possible, responsibility for remedying any identified remaining barriers will be directed to the contractor who completed the work. If (1) the work was funded through the Advisory Committee Fund; (2) the work is no longer under warranty with the contractor, and (3) the work would need to be completed by that contractor rather than by members of the City's Department of Public Works, the barrier will be treated as a barrier identified by a Class Member for purposes of prioritization and removal. If the work was funded through a source other than the Advisory Committee Fund, the City will be responsible for removing the remaining barriers through funds other than the Advisory Committee Funds or through use of City employees to perform the work.

Following the production of each Monitoring Report, Class Counsel will have 60 days to assert that the Monitoring Report raises concerns about any broad systemic issues regarding barrier removal. If Class Counsel asserts that such issues are identified through the Monitoring Report, Class Counsel will bring such issues to the attention of the City and identify a plan to remedy such issues.

At the end of the 60 day period, counsel will meet and confer to determine what additional steps, if any, are necessary to address issues raised in the Monitoring Report. If the Parties do not agree whether additional steps are necessary, or if the Parties do not agree what additional steps should be taken, the dispute will be resolved through the Dispute Resolution Procedure set forth in § VI.C., below.

#### С. Extension of Monitoring Period

Within 120 days after the receipt of the third Monitoring Report, Class Counsel may file a motion with the Court for an extension of the monitoring period and the continuing production of additional Monitoring Reports upon a showing of good cause.

#### D. M onitoring Fees

The City will pay Class Counsel reasonable attorneys' fees and costs up to an annual cap of \$1,000 for the duration of the Monitoring Period (three years plus any extension that may be granted pursuant to § V.C, above) for work performed to oversee the reporting and monitoring efforts as set forth in this Agreement. Within 90 days after receipt of each Annual Report and

(510) 451-8644

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Monitoring Report (when provided), Class Counsel will submit all time records showing fees and costs incurred in reviewing the Annual Report and Monitoring Report and informally addressing any issues raised by such reports outside of the Dispute Resolution Process. The Parties will attempt to reach agreement on payment of monitoring fees. If the Parties cannot reach agreement, either Party may invoke the Dispute Resolution Process.

#### VI. DISPUTE RESOLUTION

Should a dispute over the implementation of this Agreement arise, the Parties agree that the following Dispute Resolution Procedure will be the exclusive procedure for addressing such disputes. In any dispute raised under this procedure, the Class shall be represented by Class Counsel.

#### Α. **Juris diction**

The Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement for the duration of the Compliance Period. The Court may delegate its authority to a Magistrate Judge.

# В. Scope of Dispute Resolution Process

Class Counsel or the City may initiate the Dispute Resolution Process regarding any issue addressed in this Agreement based on a good faith belief that the other Party is failing to comply with the terms of the Agreement. With regard to the selection and prioritization of projects using the Advisory Committee Fund, Class Counsel may assert that the City is in violation of the Agreement based only on reasonable evidence and a good faith belief that the City has abused its discretion.

# C. Dispute Resolution Procedure

Except as otherwise set forth herein, all disputes concerning compliance with this Agreement shall be resolved as follows:

- 1. Counsel for the Parties will first meet and confer in order to attempt to resolve the dispute directly.
- 2. If the Parties cannot resolve a dispute directly they may engage a private mediator to mediate the dispute. If the Parties cannot agree on a mediator or if they cannot agree on the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

allocation of fees and costs for mediation, they may ask the Court to appoint a mediator or they may proceed directly to step three, below.

3. If the Parties cannot reach agreement on terms for mediation or if mediation is unsuccessful, Counsel for either Party can bring a motion to enforce the Settlement Agreement.

## D. Fees and Costs for Dispute Resolution

Except as set forth herein, fees and costs incurred in the resolution of any disputes will be awarded in accordance with Christianberg Garment Co. v. EEOC, 434 U.S. 412 (1978). However, in any dispute based on concerns raised by a complaining Class Member regarding the selection and prioritization of projects funded by the Advisory Committee Fund, if such a dispute is resolved through a motion to the Court, fees and costs incurred in the resolution of the dispute will be awarded to the prevailing Party. For purposes of such a dispute, the complaining Class Member who asserts that the City has abused its discretion in selecting and prioritizing projects funded by the Advisory Committee Fund will be treated as a Party to the dispute.

#### DAMAGES, ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS VII.

# Α. Damages

No later than 120 days after Final Approval by the Court of this Settlement Agreement, the City shall pay Named Plaintiff Gary Nystrom the total sum of \$4,000 in compensation for his individual damages claim under applicable federal and state access laws, including California Civil Code §§ 51 and 54. The City can satisfy this obligation by delivering a check to Class Counsel. No monetary payments shall be made to Class Members and no claims for damages by the Class or any Class Member except the Named Plaintiff shall be released.

## В. Attorneys' Fees and Costs

Within 30 days after execution of this Agreement by the Parties, Class Counsel will provide the City with documents showing all fees and costs incurred during the merits phase of this proceeding (i.e. all fees and costs incurred as of that date). The parties will negotiate to determine if they can agree on a total amount of fees and costs owed for such merits work. If the parties cannot agree on that total amount, the parties agree to proceed to mediation on this issue.

(510) 451-8644

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

If the parties cannot agree on a mediator, they will request from JAMS a list of three proposed mediators selected by JAMS, and each party may reject one proposed mediator.

If the Parties cannot agree on fees and costs for merits work prior to the Fairness Hearing, either Party can withdraw from the Agreement. If the Parties reach an agreement on fees and costs for merits work, Class Counsel will file a fee motion with the Court, as required by Rule 23(h) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure for the amount agreed upon by the Parties, and the City will not oppose such fee motion.

Within 30 days following Final Approval of the Agreement, Class Counsel will provide the City with additional documents showing all additional fees and costs for work done during the settlement approval process. The Parties will again negotiate and mediate, if necessary, in the manner described in the preceding paragraph, to determine if they can agree on a total amount of fees and costs owed for such work. If the Parties reach an agreement on fees and costs for work during the settlement approval process, Class Counsel will file a fee motion with the Court, as required by Rule 23(h) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure for the amount agreed upon by the Parties, and the City will not oppose such fee motion. If the Parties cannot reach agreement within 90 days after negotiations begin, Class Counsel will file a motion for all recoverable fees and costs for work during the settlement approval process, and the City maintains all rights to oppose said motion.

The two fee motions described in this section may be combined and jointly presented to the Court.

# VIII. RELEASES

# Α. Named Plaintiff and Class Release of Injunctive Relief Claims

Except as otherwise provided in this Agreement, Named Plaintiff Gary Nystrom and Class Members, for themselves, their successors and their assigns, hereby release and forever discharge Defendants and their successors, assigns, officers, directors, and past and present

449 Fifteenth Street, Suite 303 Oakland, California 94612 (510) 451-8644 1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

agents, attorneys, employees, independent contractors, and owners ("Released Parties") from any and all claims for declaratory or injunctive relief that were, or could have been, raised in this action under any or all applicable law relating to the accessibility of Pedestrian Rights of Way, including, but not limited to, the Americans with Disabilities Act, the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, §§ 51 and 54 of the California Civil Code, and §§ 4450 and 11135 of the California Government Code for the duration of the Compliance Period.

# Β. Named Plaintiff's R elease of Damages Claims

Except as otherwise provided in this Settlement Agreement, and subject to the payment of funds as described in § V(A), above, and in consideration of such payments, Named Plaintiff Gary Nystrom hereby releases and forever discharges the Released Parties from any and all claims, demands, causes of action, obligations, damages and liabilities that have arisen at any time up through the end of the Compliance Period that were or could be asserted in this Action concerning access to Pedestrian Rights of Way in the City of Vacaville, whether based on statute, regulation, contract, tort or other legal or equitable theory of recovery whatsoever, and whether known or unknown, however, this release shall not preclude any tort claim associated with any physical injury that might be suffered at any time following execution of this Agreement due to existing access barriers in the Pedestrian Rights of Way. Named Plaintiff also waives California Civil Code § 1542, which provides in pertinent part:

A general release does not extend to claims which the creditor does not know or suspect to exist in his or her favor at the time of executing the release, which if known by him or her must have materially affected his or her settlement with the debtor.

# C. No Release of Named Plaintiff's Future Tort Damages

Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be interpreted as a release by Named Plaintiff of any tort claim associated with any physical injury that might be suffered in the future due to existing access barriers in the Pedestrian Rights of Way.

///

(510) 451-8644

# D. No Release of Class Tort Damages

Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be interpreted as a release of any claims for tort damages by the Class and/or any Class Member except the Named Plaintiff.

#### IX. MISCELLANEOUS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

#### Α. Point Person

The City shall designate a "point person" who shall be responsible for coordinating and providing all reports required by this Agreement. The Point Person will also have authority to collect information concerning Defendants' obligations and actions regarding compliance with this Agreement and to respond to requests for information or other documents as provided in this Settlement Agreement.

#### Β. Dismissal

Within 30 days following Final Approval, Class Counsel shall file a signed form of request for dismissal with prejudice, except that the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce the settlement as set forth in § VI.A., above.

# C. Entire Agreement

This Settlement Agreement contains the entire agreement between the Parties regarding access to Pedestrian Rights of Way in the City of Vacaville. No modifications or limits will be binding on the Parties unless expressly provided for in this Agreement or made by writing signed by all Parties. This Agreement expresses the complete and final understanding with respect to the subject matter of this Agreement. The Parties hereto understand and agree that the terms of this Agreement supersede any prior discussions, understandings, or agreements between them related to the subject matter hereof.

# D. Counterparts

This Agreement may be executed in counterparts, each of which will be considered an original, but all of which, when taken together, will constitute one and the same instrument.

(510) 451-8644

## Ε. Interpretation

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

The language of this Agreement will be construed as a whole according to its fair meaning, and not strictly for or against any of the Parties. The headings in this Agreement are solely for convenience and will not be considered in its interpretation. Where required by context, the plural includes the singular and the singular includes the plural. This Agreement is the product of negotiation and joint drafting so that any ambiguity will not be construed against any Party.

# F. Severability

In the event any portion of this Agreement is deemed to be unenforceable, or is in conflict with applicable law, the remainder of this Agreement will be enforced and will remain in full force and effect.

# AGREED TO IN FORM:

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: DISABILITY RIGHTS ADV	OCATES	FOR THE DEFENDANTS BERTRAND, FOX & ELLIOT		
Melissa W. Kasnitz Attorneys for Plaintiffs	Date	Eugene B. Elliot Date Attorneys for Defendants		
 Gary Nystrom Plaintiff	Date			
 Mayor Leonard J. Augustine City of Vacaville	Date			

\\Server\Cases\Nystrom.Vacaville\Settlement\\Settlement\_Final01.doc